Monday, 16th April, 1917.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

Prayers by the Rev. Samuel Cooke.

Mr. *Farris* presented a further interim report from the Select Committee appointed to inquire into all matters relating to the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, as follows:—

LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE ROOM, April 16th, 1917.

MR. SPEAKER:

Your Select Committee to inquire into the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway begs to submit a further interim report, as follows:—

Your Committee reports that Mr. D'Arcy Tate, a witness before the Committee, did, on the 13th of April last whilst testifying before the said Committee, refuse to answer questions, as appears by the transcript of the said proceedings, which is attached hereto as part of this report.

Your Committee further reports that if the House be of the opinion that further powers are necessary, further requests that such powers be given it to compel Mr. D'Arcy Tate, and any other person or persons, in any matter, directly or indirectly, connected with the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, or Foley, Welch & Stewart, or P. Welch, or any other persons whatsoever, to give any and all evidence, produce any and all papers and vouchers showing the disposition of any moneys for campaign purposes, or for political purposes, or otherwise for the purpose of obtaining charters, advantages or benefits, or moneys, or influence in respect of and in support of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, its properties or enterprises, or contract or undertakings; and that the House do take such steps to compel such evidence to be given.

J. W. DE B. FARRIS, Chairman.

The report was received.

The House resumed the adjourned debate on the motion moved by the Hon. Mr. Oliver on the 13th instant, as follows:---

That all letters, papers, vouchers, and documents relating to the payment of \$7,920 to Andrew Laidlaw as a refund of moneys paid on account of lands purchased or sought to be purchased from the Province of British Columbia be referred to the Public Accounts Committee, with instructions to inquire into the whole question of the payment of the moneys above referred to; and with further instructions to report to this House their findings as to the person or persons responsible for the payment before mentioned.

Resolution agreed to.

On the motion of Mr. Cowper, seconded by Dr. McIntosh, it was Resolved,-

That an Order of the House be granted for a Return of all letters, memoranda, or applications (if any), whether marked "Personal" or otherwise, written by J. S. Cowper, sixth Member for Vancouver, to any member of the Government requesting any appointment to any position in the Civil Service of British Columbia for any member of his family.

On the motion of Mr. Ross, seconded by Mr. Pooley, it was Resolved,-

That an Order of the House be granted for a Return of copies of all correspondence and documents in the possession of the Government relating to the employment of Price, Waterhouse & Co. to make special audits for the Government, including vouchers and pay-rolls to end of March, 1917.

On the motion of the Hon. Mr. Brewster, seconded by Mr. Bowser, it was Resolved,-

That Francis J. A. MacKenzie, Member of the Legislative Assembly of this Province for the Delta Electoral District, be permitted during the whole of this Session of the said Assembly to absent himself from attendance in the said Assembly, and that, notwithstanding that the said Francis J. A. MacKenzie has not taken the oath required by section 27 of the "Constitution Act," the statutory indemnity be paid the said Member by the Clerk of the House upon proof of absence as required in the manner provided by subsection (2) of section 66 of chapter 44 of the "Revised Statutes of British Columbia, 1911," as enacted by section 8 of chapter 14 of the Statutes of 1916.

The Hon. Mr. Oliver moved, seconded by the Hon. Mr. Brewster,-

That the Select Committee, consisting of eight Members of this House—namely, Messrs. Farris, Hall, Hanes, Anderson, Yorston, Ross, Shatford, and Pooley—appointed on the 14th day of March last to inquire into all matters directly or indirectly relating to the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, be and said Committee are hereby authorized and empowered to take the evidence of Mr. D'Arcy Tate and any other person or persons in any matter directly or indirectly connected with the Pacific Great Eastern Railway Company, or with Foley, Welch & Stewart, or with P. Welch, or any other person whatsoever to give any and all evidence, produce any and all papers and vouchers showing the disposition of any moneys for campaign or political purposes, or for the purpose of obtaining charfers, advantages, or benefits, or moneys, or influence in respect of and in support of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, its properties or enterprises, or contract or undertakings.

Mr. Bowser moved in amendment, seconded by Mr. Ross,-

That the following words be added after the word "Welch," in the seventh line: "or with J. W. Stewart or with Angus Stewart." And the following words after the word "purposes," in the ninth line: "to any political party or to any person or persons for, on behalf of, or in the interest of or for the benefit of any political party, or any candidate at any general or at any by-election."

Mr. Courper moved in amendment to the amendment, seconded by Dr. McIntosh,— To add after the name "Angus Stewart" the name "D. McLeod."

The amendment to the amendment was negatived on the following division:-

YEAS-11.

Messieurs

Rose, Hayward, Macdonald, K. C., Cowper, McIntosh

NAYS-29.

Messieurs

Anderson, Bell, Yorston, Buckham, Fisher, Hanes, Mobley, Willson,

Pooley,

Jones.

Schofield,

Nelson, Macdonald, M. A., Brewster, Oliver, King, Keen, Farris,

McDonald, A.,

Ross.

Bowser.

Hart, Sutherland, Manson, Thompson, MacLean, Pattullo, Sloan,

Whiteside, Walters, McGeer, Barrow, Stewart, Pauline, Hall.

The amendment was negatived on the following division :---

Pooley, Schofield, Jones, McDonald, A., YEAS—8. Messieurs Ross, Bowser,

Rose, Cowper.

	N	AYS-31.	
	Μ		
Anderson,	Willson,	Hart,	Walters,
Bell,	Nelson,	Sutherland,	McGeer,
Yorston,	Macdonald, M. A.,	Manson,	Barrow,
Buckham,	Brewster,	Thompson,	Stewart,
Fisher,	Oliver,	MacLean,	Pauline,
Hanes,	King,	Pattullo,	McIntosh,
Macdonald, K. C.,	Keen,	Sloan,	Hall,
Mobley,	Farris,	Whiteside,	

Debate on original question resumed.

Mr. Cowper moved in amendment, seconded by Dr. McIntosh,---To insert after the name "Tate," in the fifth line, the name "D. McLeod."

The amendment was negatived on the following division :---

Yeas-12.

Messieurs Bowser. Macdonald, K. C., McDonald, A., Pooley, Cowper. Schofield, Bell. Rose. McIntosh. Jones. Ross. Hayward. NAYS-28. Messieurs Hart. Whiteside, Anderson. Nelson. Sutherland, Walters, Yorston. Macdonald, M. A., McGeer. Buckham, Brewster, Manson, Fisher, Oliver, Thompson, Barrow. Stewart. MacLean, Hanes. King, Keen, Pattullo. Pauline, Mobley. Hall. Willson. Farris. Sloan,

Original question proposed, and Resolved in the affirmative.

FIVE O'CLOCK P.M.

His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor having entered the House, and being seated in the Chair,-

Thornton Fell, K.C., the Clerk of the House, read the title to the following Bill:-

(No. 51) An Act to amend the "Vancouver Incorporation Act, 1900."

His Honour was pleased, in His Majesty's name, to give assent to the said Bill.

"In His Majesty's name, His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor doth assent to this Bill."

On the motion of Mr. McGeer, seconded by Mr. Barrow, it was Resolved,-

That an Order of the House be granted for a Return of all letters, papers, cheques, bills of exchange, vouchers, books, and other documents relating to the payment of \$10,000 issued or paid in the purchase by the Government of the gasolene-launch "Faloma," and paid to the Pacific Marine Brokerage Co.; and that the same be referred to the Public Accounts Committee with instructions to inquire into the whole question of the payment of the moneys above referred to; and with further instructions to report to this House from time to time its findings as to the person or persons responsible for the payment before mentioned, and as to the person or persons, corporation or corporations, who received or benefited by the said \$10,000 or any part thereof.

Mr. Ross asked the Hon. the Minister of Lands the following questions :---

1. How long was R. A. Renwick in the service of the Government?

2. When was he appointed to the service and what position has he held?

3. When was he appointed as Deputy Minister of Lands?

4. What salary did he receive?

5. Has he been dismissed?

6. If so, when?

7. Why was he dismissed?

8. Where was the Hon. the Premier at the date of his dismissal?

9. Did the Premier know of his proposed dismissal?

10. Did he approve of same?

11. If he approved of same, was said approval done by a communication between the Hon. the Premier and the Hon. the Minister of Agriculture or with any other colleague?

12. If so, will a copy of said letters or telegrams be tabled?

13. Who succeeded said Renwick?

14. Was his successor previously in the services of the Crown?

15. What is the age of his successor?

16. What salary is being paid his successor?

The Hon. Mr. Pattullo replied as follows :--

"1. Fourteen years four and a half months.

"2. October 30th, 1902, appointed as Government Agent, etc., at Nelson, and Deputy Minister of Lands.

or Lanus.

"3. March 25th, 1907.

"4. \$298.33 per month.

"5. Yes.

"6. January 15th, 1917.

"7. Reorganization.

"8. Ottawa.

"9. Yes.

"10, 11, and 12. Confidential communications between members of Cabinet may not be divulged.

"13. George R. Naden.

"14. No.

"15. Fifty-one.

"16. \$298.33."

Mr. Ross asked the Hon. the Minister of Finance the following questions :--

1. Is J. E. D. Anstruther-Morton, recently reported dead in Seattle, the same person referred to in answers in Votes and Proceedings, No. 9, on March 13th, 1917, as an employee of Price, Waterhouse & Co.?

2. Has the Department conclusive evidence of his death?

3. What was his age?

4. Was he married, single, or a widower?

5. Was he an employee of Price, Waterhouse & Co. at the time of his death?

6. If so, when did he join their service?

7. When did he cease to be so employed?

8. Did he resign or was he dismissed?

9. If dismissed, what was the reason?

10. Between what dates was he employed by Price, Waterhouse & Co. on the Government Audit?

11. What salary did he receive as such employee of Price, Waterhouse & Co.?

The Hon. Mr. Brewster replied as follows:-

"The Government is informed that no J. E. D. Anstruther-Morton has been in the employ of Messrs. Price, Waterhouse & Co. for some time. About a month ago a man bearing the same name resigned a position on the staff of the said firm on account of ill-health."

Mr. Pooley asked the Hon. the Minister of Agriculture the following questions :--

With reference to the questions asked the Attorney-General regarding William Manson, late Superintendent of the Agricultural Aid Commission:—

1. For what month or portion of month was the sum of \$308.33 paid?

2. Has the said Manson been working for the said Commission since January 1st, 1917?

3. If so, what is the nature of such service?

4. Has he received any remuneration for such service?

5. If not, why not?

The Hon. Mr. Oliver replied as follows :--

"1. This payment of \$308.33 was allowance in full for Mr. Manson's services.

"2. Yes.

"3. Superintendent of Agricultural Credit Commission.

"4. Answered by No. 1.

"5. Answered by No. 1."

Mr. Bowser asked the Hon. the Minister of Public Works the following questions :---

1. Have any Road Superintendents been dismissed by the Government since November 24th, 1916?

2. What were their names and how long has each one been acting in that position?

3. What notices did each receive of his dismissal?

4. Why were they dismissed?

5. Is it the intention of the Government to take any of them back into the service?

The Hon. Dr. King replied as follows :--

"1. Yes.

"2. P. Auchinachie, since April, 1911; G. M. Benny, since March, 1910; R. F. Bonson, since April, 1911; W. J. Carr, since June, 1912; J. J. Fingland, since March, 1914; J. A. Good, since June, 1910; F. H. Hutton, since June, 1915; R. O. Jennings, since March, 1910; Hamilton Lang, since October, 1907; J. K. More, since May, 1908; H. Moffatt, since July, 1907; J. Manson, since May, 1912; H. Molyneaux, since 1908; H. Munroe, since October, 1915; J. N. McLeod, since May, 1915; D. McNeish, since May, 1906; R. D. MacKenzie, since April, 1912; M. McLean, since March, 1908; D. Nicholson, since March, 1911; J. Reid, since May, 1908; A. Roberts, since March, 1911; M. M. Stephens, since October, 1915; G. Snell, since March, 1913; D. G. Sutherland, since May, 1908; A. R. Trowse, since June, 1916; H. A. Turner, since April, 1910; Wm. White, since October, 1907; W. A. Williscroft, since May, 1909; and J. Wilmshurst, since March, 1909.

"3. Written notice December 11th, 1916, stating services no longer required.

"4. Closing-down of work.

"5. Their applications will be considered with others."

Mr. Anderson asked the Hon. the Minister of Public Works the following questions:-

1. What was the total cost of the bridge across the South Thompson River at Shuswap?

2. What is the name of each and every person supplying material used in the construction of this bridge, giving the amount of such material and the price paid by the Government?

3. Were tenders invited from the public by proper advertisement for all material so supplied? If so, what are the names of each person so tendering and the amount of each tender?

4. Have any estimates been made of the cost of construction of bridges across the following streams: (a) The South Thompson River at Chase; (b) between Little Shuswap Lake and the South-west Arm of Shuswap Lake; (c) Adams River; (d) Scotch Creek? If so, what is the amount of each estimate?

The Hon. Dr. King replied as follows :--

"1. \$26,772.52.

"2. (See attached Statement.)

"3. Called for tenders for piling, 15th August, 1912; advertised in Kamloops and Salmon Arm papers. A. McConnell: Lengths, 25 to 35 feet, at 16 cents per lineal foot; lengths, 35 to 45 feet, at 17 cents per lineal foot; delivered at bridge-site. Jas. Evans: All lengths, 22 cents per lineal foot, f.o.b. on cars at Salmon Arm or Canoe Station. Contract awarded to McConnell, 21st August, 1912. Iron ordered from Ross & Howard, Vancouver, 27th November, 1912. Adams River Lumber Company, Chase, asked for bids on timber, 27th November, 1912; replied, 7th

7

"4. No."

STATEMENT.

Arrow Lakes Lumber Co.—\$4.05; 195 feet lumber; \$18 to \$21 per 1,000 feet.

L. T. Blair-\$11; gum boots, \$5.50 per pair.

L. C. Byers-\$54.34; 1,356 feet lumber; \$15 per 1,000 feet.

L. C. Byers-\$70; 10,000 lb. hay; \$20 and \$25 per ton.

L. C. Byers-\$96; 47 feet rubber hose; 18 cents per foot.

L. C. Byers-\$30; 16 gallons gasolene; \$5 per case.

N. S. Dalgleish-\$12.45; saws and block.

W. J. Ellis & Co.-\$39.89; hardware.

Hudson's Bay Co.-\$15.40; hip-boots, \$7.50 per pair and express.

Imperial Oil Co.-\$55.74; 160 gallons gasolene; 331/2 and 341/2 cents per gallon.

A. McConnell—\$437.58; 570,030 feet lumber; \$14 to \$30; select D 4 S, \$33 to \$42 per 1,000 feet; clear cedar, \$45 per 1,000 feet.

A. McConnell—\$180.76; 3,039 feet piling; 25 to 35 feet, 16 cents per lineal foot; 35 to 45 feet, 17 cents per lineal foot.

A. McConnell-\$447.76; 20 gallons paint; \$1.75 per gallon.

A. McConnell-\$12,776.99; 100 white lead; 10 cents per pound.

A. McConnell-\$36.83; 5 gallons boiled oil; \$1.50 per gallon.

A. McConnell—\$390; 412 B.S. coal, 512 lb. nails; coal, \$1.75 per 100 lb; clout nails, 8 cents per pound, 34 inch.

A. McConnell—\$73.80; 130 feet galvanized cable; 13 cents per foot; steel nails, 6½ and 7 cents per pound.

E. G. Prior & Co., Ltd.—\$410.30; 3,219 lb. round iron; sundry hardware; round iron, % inch to 1 inch, \$3.75 to \$4.25 per 100 lb.

E. G. Prior & Co., Ltd.—\$224.97; 1,500 lb. nails, 2,800 lb. wrought nails; wire nails, 4 inch to 8 inch, \$4.25 to \$4.60 per keg.

E. G. Prior & Co., Ltd.—\$251; bridge-spikes, 1,000 lb. wire spikes; spikes, % x % x 8, \$4.80 per keg; wire spikes, \$3.75 per keg.

Ross & Howard—\$843.95; 6,793 lb. bridge-blocks, 1,564 lb. gib-plates; 6,732 lb. rods, 550 lb. washers, 1,247 lb. lag-screws; bridge-blocks and washers, 4½ cents per pound; gib-plates, rods, bolts, and lag screws, 5½ cents per pound.

Smith Saddlery Co.-\$1.50; sweat-pad.

A. G. Talbot-\$68.15; 2,261 lb. hay; \$20 per ton.

A. G. Talbot-\$25.35; 4,268 lb. oats; \$35 per ton.

A. G. Talbot-\$30.05; 400 lb. bran; \$1.60 per 100 lb.

A. G. Talbot—\$67.66; 789 lb. nails; 2½-4 inches, 4½ and 5 cents per pound.

A. G. Talbot-\$30.85; 100 lb. spikes; 4½ cents per pound.

A. B. Ward-\$2; dry cells.

Wilcox & Hall-\$2.45; 6 feet hose, 1 bottle lard-oil; hose, 35 cents per foot; lard-oil, 35 cents per bottle.

Wilcox & Hall-\$86.15; 50 gallons boiled oil; \$1.40 per gallon.

Wilcox & Hall-\$2.76; 5 gallons turpentine, 44 lb. pitch; turpentine, \$1.50 per gallon; pitch, 4 cents per pound.

Bill (No. 17) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Egg Marks Act'" was read a third time and passed.

Bill (No. 14) intituled "An Act for the Better Protection of Sheep" was again committed. Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock to-morrow.

And then the House adjourned at 5.50 p.m.

Tuesday, 17th April, 1917.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

Prayers by the Rev. Ernest G. Miller.

Mr. *Farris* rose and moved the adoption of the report presented on 16th inst. from the Select Committee appointed to inquire into all matters relating to the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway.

On objection taken, that the motion could not be made without notice, Mr. Speaker Weart sustained the objection.

Mr. *Farris* moved the adjournment of the House to discuss a matter of urgent public importance.

Mr. Speaker Weart referred to "Speakers' Decisions," page 169, as not having been complied with by the mover of the Resolution.

After some discussion, the question was proposed, "Shall the fourth Member for Vancouver City be allowed to proceed with the motion," and *Resolved* in the affirmative.

Motion made, "That the House do now adjourn," and after debate, Resolved in the negative.

Pursuant to Order, the House resolved itself into a Committee of the Whole to consider the Resolution, "That a Supply be granted to His Majesty."

(IN THE COMMITTEE.)

Resolved, That a Supply be granted to His Majesty, and that the Committee rise and report the Resolution.

The Resolution was reported and adopted.

On the motion of the Hon. the Minister of Finance, seconded by the Hon. the Attorney-General, it was *Resolved*,—

That the House will at its next session resolve itself into a Committee of Supply.

Mr. Bowser asked the Hon. the Attorney-General the following questions:-

1. Have naturalization papers been issued yet to F. J. Harding, an employee of the Workmen's Compensation Board?

2. If so, when?

The Hon. Mr. Macdonald replied as follows :--

"1. Yes.

"2. March 23rd, 1917."

Mr. Bowser asked the Hon. the Attorney-General the following questions :-

1. Has Leo Mader, of Grand Forks, been acting as a Provincial Game Warden?

2. If so, when was he appointed?

3. Has he been dismissed?

4. If so, when?

5. What were the reasons for his dismissal?

6. What notice did he receive that his services would be no longer required?

7. Has a successor been appointed?

The Hon. Mr. Macdonald replied as follows :---

"1. Yes.

"2. August 15th, 1913.

"3. Yes. Duties of his office were transferred to the Provincial police at that point.

"4. Left service April 4th, 1917.

17TH APRIL.

"5. Duplication of services and dispensing with unnecessary official where Provincial constable was competent to take over the work.

"6. Notified March 30th; left service April 4th.

"7. No. Answered by No. 5."

Mr. Couper asked the Hon. the Premier the following questions :---

1. Has the Government or any member thereof received a deputation asking that Government printing be taken away from the Government Printing Office and given to The Vancouver Sun Printing Office?

2. If so, what are the names of the gentlemen who composed the delegation?

The Hon. Mr. Brewster replied as follows :---

"1. As stated in answer to question on April 12th, various representations have been made in respect of any printing the Government thought wise to give out.

"2. Matters informally discussed by Messrs. McDonald, Wade, and Langan."

Mr. Bowser asked the Hon. the Attorney-General the following questions:-

1. Was H. Ferguson, of Revelstoke, formerly a Game Warden?

2. When was he appointed?

3. Has he been dismissed?

4. If so, when?

5. Why was he dismissed?

6. What notice of dismissal did he receive?

7. Has a successor been appointed?

8. If so, what is his name?

9. Is Ferguson a married man?

10. Is his successor a married man?

11. Was any effort made to appoint a returned soldier in place of Ferguson?

12. What salary was Ferguson in receipt of?

13. What salary is his successor receiving?

The Hon. Mr. Macdonald replied as follows :---

"1. Yes.

"2. April 1st, 1914.

"3. Yes.

"4. Notified by wire January 24th; by letter January 25th; to take effect February 1st, 1917.

"5. Inattention to duties and offensive partizanship.

"6. Answered by No. 4.

"7. Appointment being held in abeyance.

"S. Answered by No. 7.

"9. Yes.

"10. No successor.

"11. Answered by No. 7.

"12. \$75 per month.

"13. Answered by No. 10."

Bill (No. 13) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Water Act, 1914'" was again committed. Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

The House resumed the adjourned debate on the second reading of Bill (No. 21) intituled "An Act respecting a certain By-election holden in Vancouver City Electoral District on the Twenty-sixth Day of February, 1916."

Question proposed, "That the Bill be read a second time now."

Mr. Ross moved in amendment, seconded by Dr. Rose, "To leave out the word 'now' and add the words 'this day six months."

17TH APRIL.

During the debate, and while Mr. *Cowper*, the junior Member for Vancouver City, had the floor, the Hon. Mr. *Oliver* objected to certain words used by the said junior Member for the City of Vancouver as containing a serious charge against a Member of this House, and requested that the said words be taken down.

The Clerk took down the words objected to, as follows :---

"The words used were in effect that the sum of \$25,000 was placed in a safe in the Hotel Vancouver by or on behalf of the Canadian Northern on the night of the 13th day of September last, and that the same money was received or taken away the next morning by a person who was a Liberal candidate at the by-election of February 26th, 1916, and also at the general election of September 14th last."

Question proposed, "Shall the word proposed to be struck out stand part of the question?" and *Resolved* in the affirmative on the following division:—

	Mes	ssieurs		,
Bowser, Hayward, Maedonald, K. C., Mobley, Willson, Nelson, Cowper, Brewster, Oliver	•	King, Keen, Farris, Hart, Sutherland, Manson, Thompson, MacLean, Datheyle,		Sloan, Whiteside, Walters, McGeer, Barrow, Stewart, Pauline, McIntosh, Hall.
	Hayward, Macdonald, K. C., Mobley, Willson, Nelson, Cowper,	Bowser, Hayward, Macdonald, K. C., Mobley, Willson, Nelson, Cowper, Brewster,	Bowser,King,Hayward,Keen,Macdonald, K. C.,Farris,Mobley,Hart,Willson,Sutherland,Nelson,Manson,Cowper,Thompson,Brewster,MacLean,	Bowser,King,Hayward,Keen,Macdonald, K. C.,Farris,Mobley,Hart,Willson,Sutherland,Nelson,Manson,Cowper,Thompson,Brewster,MacLean,

NAYS-2.

Messieurs

Ross,

Rose.

Barrow.

Stewart.

Pauline.

Hall.

		ALING IL.	
Pooley,	McDonald, A.,	Ross,	Cowper,
Schofield,	Buckham,	Bowser,	McIntosh,
Jones,	Fisher,	Rose,	
		NAYS-26.	
		Messieurs	
Bell,	Brewster,	Manson,	Walters,
Hayward,	Oliver,	Thompson,	McGeer,

Haywara,Outer,Macdonald, K. C.,King,Mobley,Keen,Willson,Farris,Nelson,Hart,Macdonald, M. A.,Sutherland,

Bill read a second time. To be committed to-morrow.

Bill (No. 24) initialed "An Act to amend the 'Complex Ore Process Aid Act'" was read a second time, and *Ordered* to be committed to-morrow.

MacLean.

Pattullo,

Whiteside.

Sloan,

On the second reading of Bill (No. 25) intituled "An Act for the Protection of the Widows and Children of Deceased Soldiers and Sailors" a debate arose, which was, on the motion of the Hon. the Attorney-General, adjourned until to-morrow. Bill read a second time.

To be committed to-morrow.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock to-morrow.

And then the House adjourned at 5.43 p.m.

Wednesday, 18th April, 1917.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

Prayers by the Rev. M. Theo. Habershone.

Mr. *Farris* presented a further interim report from the Select Committee appointed to inquire into all matters relating to the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, as follows:—

I beg to present herewith an interim report of your Select Committee inquiring into Pacific Great Eastern Railway *et al.*, recommending that pages 1145 to 1377 (inclusive) of the evidence taken before said Committee be printed.

J. W. DE B. FARRIS, Chairman.

With the consent of the House, the report was received. The Rules and Orders were suspended, and the report adopted.

Mr. *Farris* presented a further interim report from the Select Committee appointed to inquire into all matters relating to the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, as follows:—

LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE ROOM, April 18th, 1917.

MR. SPEAKER:

Your Committee appointed to inquire into construction of Pacific Great Eastern Railway begs to report further as follows:—

1. That at the conclusion of the sittings of this Committee on Friday last, Mr. D'Arcy Tate, who was examined on that day, and concerning which and his refusal to answer certain questions a report has already been made to this House, was notified by the Committee to attend for further examination before the Committee on the 17th inst. at the hour of 10 o'clock in the forenoon, at which time your Committee was advised by Mr. H. A. Maclean, K.C., counsel for said Tate, that he had been instructed by Mr. Tate to state that he, the said Tate, declined to appear to be examined with regard to his payment for campaign funds; Mr. Maclean further stated as counsel that Mr. Tate was aware that he was required to attend before the Committee at the said time and place. Your Committee further reports that Mr. R. D. Thomas, the secretary and treasurer of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway Company, testified before your Committee following the statement by Mr. Maclean that Mr. Tate would return.

2. That Mr. Thomas further stated before your Committee that Mr. D'Arcy Tate, on the day previous to the 13th inst. last, when Mr. Tate gave the evidence before Committee heretofore reported to this House, with respect to payments by the said Tate of moneys for campaign purposes, that said Tate had discussed the matter with the witness, and had told him that he, the said Tate, had disbursed moneys for campaign funds and party purposes, and had told him, the

1917 -

witness, the names of the parties to whom the money had been paid; and the witness further stated that he had the said names in his possession. Upon being asked to state to your Committee these names, Mr. Thomas definitely refused to disclose the information.

3. Your Committee further begs to report that on the session held on the 13th inst., Mr. E. F. White, a director of the said Railway Company and chief clerk and personal representative of P. Welch, stated to your Committee that he had the custody and control of the private ledger of P. Welch, contraining entries referred to in the ledger of P. Welch, contractor, "as transferred to private ledger," and the said White undertook to your Committee to produce said ledger to your said Committee at its sittings commencing at 10 a.m., Tuesday, the 17th inst. At the said sittings Mr. White produced one private ledger. He stated that there were two other ledgers, Nos. 2 and 3, part of the same system of books and containing similar entries, which books he did not produce because they were personal matters. He further stated that the said books were still in the Vancouver office of P. Welch, and that Mr. P. Welch had gone to Seattle on the Monday, the 16th inst., and that he might go from there to Spokane, and witness did not know when he would return. Mr. E. P. Davis, K.C., counsel for Mr. P. Welch, stated that said ledgers numbered 2 and 3 would not be produced, notwithstanding the ruling of your Committee that the said ledgers were required to properly and fully conduct their investigations directed to be taken by this House.

All of which is respectfully submitted.

.

J. W. DE B. FARRIS, Chairman of Committee.

The report was received.

As a matter of privilege, on the motion of Mr. Farris, seconded by Mr. Hall, it was Resolved,—

That whereas D'Arcy Tate, a witness before the Select Committee to inquire into the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, and who, on the 13th day of April, 1917, did refuse to answer questions put to him by the said Committee, that the Speaker do issue his warrant to compel the said D'Arcy Tate to appear at the Bar of this House forthwith to answer the said questions, and to answer for his said conduct, and to be dealt with as the House may see fit.

As a matter of privilege, on the motion of Mr. Farris, seconded by Mr. Hall, it was Resolved,-

That whereas R. D. Thomas, a witness before the Select Committee to inquire into the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, and who, on the 17th day of April, 1917, did refuse to answer questions put to him by the said Committee, that the Speaker do issue a subpœna to the said Thomas to personally appear at the Bar of this House forthwith to answer the said questions, and to answer for his said conduct, and to be dealt with as the House may see fit.

On the motion of the Hon. Mr. Oliver, seconded by the Hon. Mr. Brewster, it was Resolved,-

That the Votes and Proceedings of Tuesday, April 17th, be amended by the insertion of the words uttered by the junior Member for the City of Vancouver and taken down at the request of the Hon. the Minister of Railways.

The Hon. Mr. Macdonald presented to Mr. Speaker a Message from His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, which read as follows:---

F. S. BARNARD,

Lieutenant-Governor.

The Lieutenant-Governor transmits herewith a Bill intituled "An Act to amend the 'Sale of Goods Act," and recommends the same to the Legislative Assembly.

Government House, April 18th, 1917. Ordered, That the said Message, and the Bill accompanying the same, be referred to a Committee of the Whole House forthwith.

(IN THE COMMITTEE.)

Resolved, That the Committee rise and report to the House, recommending the introduction of a Bill (No. 26) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Sale of Goods Act,'" a draft of which is annexed to this Resolution.

Resolution and Bill reported. Bill introduced and read a first time. Second reading at the next sitting.

The Hon. Mr. Macdonald presented to Mr. Speaker a Message from His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, which read as follows:---

F. S. BARNARD,

Lieutenant-Governor.

The Lieutenant-Governor transmits herewith a Bill intituled "An Act to amend the 'Assignment of Book Accounts Act,'" and recommends the same to the Legislative Assembly.

Government House,

April 18th, 1917.

Ordered, That the said Message, and the Bill accompanying the same, be referred to a Committee of the Whole House forthwith.

(IN THE COMMITTEE.)

Resolved, That the Committee rise and report to the House, recommending the introduction of a Bill (No. 27) initialed "An Act to amend the 'Assignment of Book Accounts Act,' " a draft of which is annexed to this Resolution.

Resolution and Bill reported. Bill introduced and read a first time. Second reading at the next sitting.

On the motion of the Hon. Mr. *Pattullo*, Bill (No. 28) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Timber Royalty Act'" was introduced, read a first time, and *Ordered* to be read a second time to-morrow.

Mr. Pooley asked the Hon. the Minister of Public Works the following questions:---

- 1. Was James Craig, of Craig's Crossing, formerly a road foreman in Alberni District?
- 2. When was he appointed?
- 3. What salary was he in receipt of?
- 4. Has he been dismissed?
- 5. If so, when?
- 6. What notice was he given of his dismissal?
- 7. Why was he dismissed?
- 8. Has a successor been appointed?
- 9. If so, who is he?
- 10. On whose recommendation was his successor appointed?
- 11. What experience has his successor had?
- 12. What salary is he being paid?

The Hon. Dr. King replied as follows :--

- "1. Yes.
- "2. First employed as foreman on April 1st, 1912.
- "3. \$4 per day.
- "4. His services discontinued 30th March last.

"5, 6, and 7. Road foremen, like road labour, being paid by the day do not require notice of dismissal.

"8, 9, 10, and 11. George Parkes, of Parksville, engaged as road foreman on the recommendation of the District Engineer.

"12. Foremen with gang of less than ten men paid \$3.50 per day; with gang of ten men or more, \$4 per day."

Bill (No. 14) intituled "An Act for the Better Protection of Sheep" was again committed. Reported complete with amendment. Report to be considered to-morrow.

Bill (No. 13) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Water Act, 1914'" was again committed. Reported complete with amendments. Report to be considered to-morrow.

The Sergeant-at-Arms reported to Mr. Speaker that R. D. Thomas was in attendance at the Bar of the House and ready to be examined without the issue by Mr. Speaker of a subpœna.

Mr. Speaker read the Resolution passed this day requiring the attendance of the said R. D. Thomas.

The Speaker: Mr. R. D. Thomas, you are in attendance at the Bar of this House by virtue of a Resolution of this House passed this date, on a complaint made by the Chairman of the Select Committee to inquire into the Pacific Great Eastern Railway matters, in the following words:—

"That whereas R. D. Thomas, witness before the Select Committee to inquire into the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, and who, on the 17th day of April, 1917, did refuse to answer questions put to him by the said Committee, that the Speaker do issue a subpœna to the said Thomas to personally appear at the Bar of this House forthwith to answer the said questions, and to answer for his conduct, and to be dealt with as the House may see fit."

Mr. Farris: As the witness and stenographer were sworn before the Select Committee, I do not know that it will be necessary to have them resworn. However, I think the stenographer in any event should be resworn. I would move that the Clerk of the House be authorized to administer the oath to the stenographer and to the witness.

The Speaker: It has been moved that the stenographer and the witness be sworn. The stenographer is to be sworn to take the evidence of the witness given in this House.

Mrs. E. Blygh, stenographer, sworn.

Mr. R. D. Thomas sworn.

Mr. R. D. Thomas, witness, having been duly sworn, testifies as follows:-

Mr. Farris: Mr. Thomas, you were asked certain questions before the Select Committee appointed to inquire into the Pacific Great Eastern construction which you refused to answer. You admit that, do you? A.—Yes.

Q.—Those questions referred to a conversation which you had had with Mr. D'Arcy Tate? A.—Yes.

Q.—In connection with the payment by him of certain campaign funds—of certain moneys for campaign funds? A.—Yes.

Q.—In connection with which he had testified before the Committee? A.—Yes.

Q.—You were present, were you, when Mr. Tate gave his evidence? A.—I believe I was present during all his evidence.

Q.—When did you have the conversation with Mr. Tate that is referred to? A.—Either the day before or the day that he last appeared before the Select Committee. When I gave my evidence last on the subject I was under the impression it was the day before; but on thinking it over I am not clear, but I believe that it was the day he gave his evidence.

Q .- That would be last Friday? A .- Yes.

Q.—Now, so that there will be no mistake as to what I am questioning you about, I wish to read to you one or two questions asked Mr. Tate, so that we will know we are discussing the same thing. (Reading.)

"Mr. Taylor (to Mr. Tate): Was there any understanding at that time that you should dispose of any of these moneys in any particular way, or any part of it in any particular way? A.—No. The moneys paid to me were to take care of all incidental expenses incurred in securing the franchise, and in securing the traffic arrangement with the Grand Trunk Pacific."

Q.—You knew that arrangement referred to one he said he had made with Mr. Stewart? A.—Yes.

Q.-Prior to the incorporation of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway Company? A.-Yes.

Q.—And the franchise was the franchise in connection with that railway company? A.—Yes.

Q.—(Reading.) "And what were the incidental expenses you had to take care of? A.—I undertook to take care of the campaign funds. That is what you are after, isn't it?"

And then when the Chairman orders him to answer another question, he says: "Well, my duty was to take care of the campaign funds as far as the Conservative party was concerned."

Q .-- You heard Mr. Tate's evidence in that regard? A .-- Yes, I heard his evidence.

Q.—Now, I am asking you, Mr. Thomas, was it in connection with the campaign funds referred to in this evidence that you had a conversation with Mr. D'Arcy Tate? A.—Yes.

Q.—On Friday, the day that he testified before the Committee? A.—Yes; possibly also on the day before, but on that day as well.

Q.—He gave to you the names—he told you the names of the persons to whom he paid the money? A.—He told me the names of some persons to whom he paid the money.

Q.—And the amounts in which he paid them? A.—He mentioned several amounts. I could not swear he mentioned the amount in each case, but he mentioned several amounts, and he mentioned several names.

Q.-Who were the names he mentioned? A.-I cannot answer.

Q.-Do you know them? A.-I do.

Q .-- You know the names? A .-- Yes.

Q.-You have them now in your possession? A.-In my memory.

Q .- In your memory? A .- Yes.

Q.—And could state them if you wished? A.—Except that I am on my honour not to do so. Q.—In what way? A.—Mr. Tate discussed the matter with me in a purely personal and confidential way. He did so, I believe, so that I might understand his future conduct. Mr. Tate and I have always been (especially during the last four or five years) very close together, and he wished me to have no misunderstanding as to any future action he might take.

Q.-Mr. Tate is the Vice-President of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway? A.-Yes.

Q.-And General Counsel of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway? A.-Yes.

Q.-With offices in this city? A.-Yes.

Q.—And your position in that Company is what? A.—I am the Secretary and Treasurer and also the Auditor of the Company.

Q.—With an office adjoining Mr. Tate's in the same suite of offices? A.—Yes.

Q.—You know that Mr. Tate has defied—he has refused to answer to the Select Committee the questions in regard to these payments? A.—Yes.

Q.—And you understand that you are now being asked by this Legislative Assembly, by the authority of the Assembly and the Speaker, to answer that question, Mr. Thomas? A.—Yes.

Q .- And you refuse? A .- I do.

Q.-What were the amounts that Mr. Tate told you he had paid? A.-I decline to answer.

Mr. Shatford: Mr. Speaker, may I ask the witness a question?

The Speaker: Certainly.

Mr. Shatford: Mr. Thomas, I would like to ask you did Mr. Tate inform you as to any payment that he made on behalf of the Liberal party, or any of its candidates? A.—I cannot answer that,

Q.-You refuse to answer? A.-I do.

The Speaker: Any Member of the House has the privilege to ask him any question they wish. Mr. Farris: Mr. Speaker, I would like to move the following motion.

Mr. Bowser: Well, Mr. Speaker, I think it is only right that this witness should withdraw now when the motion is being discussed.

The Speaker: I can hardly realize that the witness can gather the full significance of his refusal to answer the questions. By chapter 137 of the "Revised Statutes of British Columbia," being the "Legislative Assembly Privileges Act," section 4 gives the Speaker the power to issue his warrant or subpœna directing attendance of the person named before the Bar of the House.

91

瘤

Section 4: "Whenever the Legislative Assembly requires the attendance of any persons before the said Assembly, or before a committee thereof, the Speaker may issue his warrant or subpœna directed to the persons named in the Order of the Legislative Assembly, requiring the attendance of such persons before the Legislative Assembly or a committee thereof, and the production of such papers and things as may be ordered."

And section 6 provides :---

"The Legislative Assembly shall have all the rights and privileges of a Court of Record for the purpose of summarily inquiring into and punishing, as breaches of privilege or as contempt of Court (without prejudice to the liability of the offenders to prosecution and punishment, criminally or otherwise, according to law, independently of this Act), the acts, matters, and things following:—"

Subsection (6): And any person-

"Giving false evidence or prevaricating or otherwise misbehaving in giving or refusing to give evidence or produce papers before the said Assembly or any committee thereof."

And section 7:-

"Every person who, upon such inquiry, appears to have committed or done any of the acts, matters or things in the last preceding section mentioned, in addition to any other penalty or punishment to which he may by law be subject, shall be liable to an imprisonment for such time during the session of the Legislative Assembly then being held, as may be determined by the said Assembly."

Mr. Speaker then asked the said R. D. Thomas if he still persisted in his refusal to answer the questions put to him, and the said R. D. Thomas still refusing to answer said questions, Mr. Speaker ordered the said R. D. Thomas to withdraw from the Bar of the House in custody of the Sergeant-at-Arms, pending the expression of the pleasure of the House.

On the motion of Mr. Farris, seconded by Mr. Hall, it was Resolved,-

That it appearing from the inquiry of this House that R. D. Thomas, a witness appearing before the Select Committee of this House appointed to inquire into the matters relating to the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, did refuse to give evidence as to certain matters pertaining to this inquiry before the said Committee, and the said R. D. Thomas, upon being brought to the Bar of this House, having persisted in his refusal to answer the said questions:

Be it Resolved, That the Legislative Assembly declares that the said person has been guilty of a contempt, and directs that the said R. D. Thomas be taken into custody and be imprisoned during this Session of the Legislative Assembly, or until otherwise ordered by this House.

(Witness returns with Sergeant-at-Arms.)

The Speaker: I am authorized by Resolution of the Legislative Assembly, which declares that you have been guilty of contempt, and directs that you be taken into custody and be imprisoned during this session of the Legislative Assembly, or until otherwise ordered by this House—by virtue of that authority I commit you to the custody of the Sergeant-at-Arms.

Bill (No. 9) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Supreme Court Act'" was again committed. Reported complete with amendments. Report to be considered to-morrow.

Bill (No. 22) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Contagious Diseases (Animals) Act'" was again committed.

Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock to-morrow.

And then the House adjourned at 6 p.m.

19TH APRIL.

Thursday, 19th April, 1917.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

Prayers by the Rev. Dr. W. L. Clay.

The Report on Bill (No. 14) intituled "Act Act for the Better Protection of Sheep" was adopted.

Bill read a third time and passed.

The Report on Bill (No. 13) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Water Act, 1914'" was adopted.

Third reading to-morrow.

The Report on Bill (No. 9) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Supreme Court Act'" was adopted.

Third reading to-morrow.

Bill (No. 18) intituled "An Act to amend the Law relating to the Guardianship and Custody of Infants" was committed.

Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Bill (No. 11) intituled "An Act to make Provision for a Mineral Survey of the Province of British Columbia and for the Development of the Mineral Resources of the said Province, including Provisions in Aid of Prospectors and Miners and for the Protection of Wage-earners and Investors" was committed.

Progress reported. Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Bill (No. 15) intituled "An Act respecting the Marking of Cattle and Horses" was committed. Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock to-morrow.

And then the House adjourned at 5.55 p.m.

Friday, 20th April, 1917.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

Prayers by the Rev. H. S. Osborne.

The Hon. the Minister of Agriculture presented the Annual Report of the Department of Agriculture for the year 1916.

The Hon. the Minister of Railways presented further replies to questions asked in the House by Mr. *Hall* on the 13th inst., as follows:---

"Re Alberni branch of Canadian Northern Pacific Railway. To complete question 10: 'If so, what was the unit price in each case?'

		Grai Smith	nt, & Co.	Moor Peth		М	A. cDon	J. ald.		North onst.		
	"Clearing per acre	. \$115	00	\$175	00		\$175	00		\$200	00	
	Grubbing per acre	. 335	00	400	00		400	00		300	00	
	Excavation per cubic yard-											
	Solid rock	. 1	00	1	00		1	00			98	
	Loose rock		50									
	Hard-pan		45				Ξ.,					
	Earth		25									
	Other material				35			35			34	
	Foundations per cubic yard-	_										
	Earth (dry)		45		50			50			40	
	Earth (wet)		80		75			75			75	
	Hard-pan (dry)		70	1	00		1	00			60	
	Hard-pan (wet)	. 1	10	1	50		1	50		2	00	
	Loose rock (dry)		75	1	00		1	00			80	
	Loose rock (wet)	. 1	25	1	50		1	50		2	00	
	Solid rock (dry)		00	2	50		2	50		2	25	
	Solid rock (wet)	. 3	00	3	00		3	00		3	00	
	Crib-work per lineal foot		16		20						20	
	Piles driven per lineal foot .		25, 30		35			35			35	
	Cut-offs		12		12							
	Frame-timber (sawn), M.B.M	I. 30	00	40	00		40	00				
	Cedar culverts, M.B.M	. 24	00	25	00		25	00			00	
	Fencing per mile	. 480	00	400	00		400	00				
	and the second sec	I	Division .	A.								
	McDonald, Nettleton, Bruce	& Esha	nch. Mile	1 to	6 (final)			\$ 107	.821	20	
	Grant, Smith & Co., Mile 6 to									,493		
	A. J. McDonald, Mile 36 to 4									,520		
	in of high on and on to to to		Division 1						.0	,020	v~	
	Moore & Pethick, Mile 40 to	60 (fi	nal)						\$ 269	.644	01	
			Division (,		
	Mana 0 Dathink Mile CO to								0=0			
	Moore & Pethick, Mile 60 to		nal) Division 1		• • • •			••	272	,014	97	
	Nonthem Construction Co. 1				1)				1 400	001		
	Northern Construction Co., M							•••	1,429	,691	24	
44 T-	Northern Construction Co. (1											
	addition to the above payment											-
	S. Doe, Selkirk Water Bridg											
	McDonald, Nettleton & Bruce									,363		
	Robertson & Partners,* Burr	isiae I	coad Bri	age .	• • • •	• • • • • •		• • • •	. 14	,809	00."	ľ

* Ten per cent. of these amounts held as drawback and unpaid on progress estimates.

On the motion of Mr. Whiteside, seconded by the Hon. Mr. Oliver, it was Resolved,-

That an Order of the House be granted for a Return of all letters, papers, accounts, cheques, vouchers, books, and other documents relating to the payments of \$177.75 for September and \$78.70 for November expenses account, and any other payments made for those months to M. B. Cotsworth as Chairman of the Civil Service Grading Commission during the year 1909, by the Province of British Columbia. Also, that the Public Accounts Committee be directed to inquire as to whether the said M. B. Cotsworth did charge the Province of British Columbia for the expenses of his journey to Quatsino to inspect certain lands he, during 1909, applied to purchase for himself and family from the Province of British Columbia, and to report to this House whether any wrong or improper means were used to acquire the lands thus applied for purchase.

Mr. Cowper asked the Hon. the Attorney-General the following questions:----

1. Since November 24th, 1916, have any representations, requests, or suggestions been made to the Hon. the Attorney-General or to any member of the Government that Police Magistrate H. C. Shaw, of Vancouver, or Deputy Police Magistrate C. J. South, or either of them or both of them, be asked for their resignations?

2. Has the Hon. the Attorney-General or any member of the Government been asked to suggest to the Police Commissioners, or the City Council, or any Commissioner or member of the City Council of Vancouver that the resignations of Police Magistrate H. C. Shaw or Deputy Magistrate C. J. South, or either of them or both of them, be requested?

3. If any suggestions have been made that Magistrate H. C. Shaw and Deputy Magistrate C. J. South, of Vancouver, or either of them or both of them, be asked for their resignations, who made such suggestions and to whom were they made?

4. What reasons for dismissal were contained in such suggestions or requests for such action?

The Hon. Mr. Macdonald replied as follows :--

"1. No. With the qualification that some parties not satisfied with decisions complained and suggested dismissals.

"2. No.

"3. Answered by Nos. 1 and 2.

"4. Answered by Nos. 1 and 2."

Mr. Bowser asked the Hon. the Attorney-General the following questions :---

1. How many claims has the Workmen's Compensation Board received since January 1st, 1917?

2. How many involve payment for compensation?

3. How many involve payment for medical aid only?

4. How many claims are complete as far as information from workmen is concerned?

5. How many are incomplete owing to failure of workmen to supply information?

6. How many are incomplete owing to failure of employers to supply information?

7. How many are incomplete owing to failure of medical men to supply information?

8. If claims are incomplete because of failure of either doctor or employer to make returns, what steps are being taken to secure this information?

9. On how many claims have payments been made?

10. Have payments been made on all claims received for injuries received during the month of January, 1917?

11. Have payments been made on all claims received for injuries received during the month of February?

12. If claims made for injuries during January and February have not been paid, when will those payments be made?

13. How many medical-aid plans in force between an employer and employee have been approved under subsection (4) of section 21 of the Act?

14. How many of said plans have been investigated by the Board?

15. If any have been investigated, how many have not received approval?

16. Are the workmen consulted when said investigation is being made?

17. If the Board has decided to maintain its head office in the City of Victoria, does it propose to open branch offices in other portions of the Province?

18. If the answer is yes, where will the branch offices be situated and when will they be opened up?

19. What steps have been taken by the Board to carry out the intent of section 51 of the Act, which deals with accident-prevention?

The Hon, the Attorney-General, on a point of order, objected that the Workmen's Compensation Board was not under the control of his Department, and that the questions could not be answered.

Mr. Speaker reserved his ruling thereon.

The following Bills were read a third time and passed :--

Bill (No. 13) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Water Act, 1914.'"

Bill (No. 9) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Supreme Court Act.'"

Bill (No. 22) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Contagious Diseases (Animals) Act'" was again committed.

Reported complete with amendments.

Report to be considered on Monday next.

Bill (No. 11) initialed "An Act to make Provision for a Mineral Survey of the Province of British Columbia and for the Development of the Mineral Resources of the said Province, including Provisions in Aid of Prospectors and Miners and for the Protection of Wage-earners and Investors" was again committed.

Reported complete with amendments. Report to be considered at next sitting.

Bill (No. 15) intituled "An Act respecting the Marking of Cattle and Horses" was again committed.

Progress reported.

Committee to sit again on Monday next.

The following papers were presented :---

By the Hon. the Attorney-General—Return of copies of all correspondence which took place between the Hon. the Attorney-General or any member of his staff with any person or persons dealing with the resignations of Constables Markland and McNelly, and all replies to such correspondence; also copies of all correspondence between the Superintendent of Police and Chief Constable Smith, of Vancouver, or with any other person or persons dealing with their resignations, and all replies to said correspondence received by said Superintendent of Police.

By the Hon, the Premier-Return of copies of all correspondence and documents in the possession of the Government relating to the employment of Price, Waterhouse & Co. to make special audits for the Government, including vouchers and pay-rolls to end of March, 1917.

By the Hon. the Minister of Mines-Bureau of Mines' Report on Iron-ore Deposits of Vancouver and Texada Islands: Bulletin No. 3, 1917.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock on Monday next.

And then the House adjourned at 6 p.m.

Monday, 23rd April, 1917.

Prayers by the Rev. F. A. P. Chadwick.

The Hon. Mr. *Pattullo* presented to Mr. Speaker a Message from His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, which read as follows:---

F. S. BARNARD, Lieutenant-Governor.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

The Lieutenant-Governor transmits herewith a Bill intituled "An Act to amend the 'Forest Act Relief Act,'" and recommends the same to the Legislative Assembly.

Government House,

April 23rd, 1917.

Ordered, That the said Message, and the Bill accompanying the same, be referred to a Committee of the Whole House forthwith.

(IN THE COMMITTEE.)

Resolved, That the Committee rise and report to the House, recommending the introduction of a Bill (No. 29) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Forest Act Relief Act,' " a draft of which is annexed to this Resolution.

Resolution and Bill reported and adopted. Bill introduced and read a first time. Second reading at the next sitting.

The Hon. Mr. Pattullo presented to Mr. Speaker a Message from His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, which read as follows:---

F. S. BARNARD,

Lieutenant-Governor.

The Lieutenant-Governor transmits herewith a Bill intituled "An Act to amend the 'Forest Act," and recommends the same to the Legislative Assembly.

Government House,

April 23rd, 1917.

Ordered, That the said Message, and the Bill accompanying the same, be referred to a Committee of the Whole House forthwith.

(IN THE COMMITTEE.)

Resolved. That the Committee rise and report to the House, recommending the introduction of a Bill (No. 30) initialed "An Act to amend the 'Forest Act,'" a draft of which is annexed to this Resolution.

Resolution and Bill reported and adopted. Bill introduced and read a first time.

Second reading at the next sitting.

The Hon. Mr. *Brewster* presented to Mr. Speaker a Message from His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, which read as follows:----

F. S. BARNARD,

Lieutenant-Governor.

The Lieutenant-Governor transmits herewith-

Estimates of sums required for the service of the Province for the fiscal year ending 31st March, 1918;

Supplementary Estimates of Expenditure for the financial year ending 31st March, 1917; and recommends the same to the Legislative Assembly.

Government House, April 23rd, 1917. Ordered, That the said Message, and the Estimates accompanying the same, be referred to the Committee of Supply.

The House proceeded to the Orders of the Day. Order for Committee of Supply called.

The Hon. Mr. Brewster moved, seconded by the Hon. Mr. Macdonald, "That Mr. Speaker do now leave the Chair."

A debate arose, which was, on the motion of Mr. Keen, adjourned until the next sitting of the House.

The Report on Bill (No. 22) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Contagious Diseases (Animals) Act'" was adopted.

Bill read a third time and passed.

Bill (No. 18) intituled "An Act to amend the Law relating to the Guardianship and Custody of Infants" was again committed.

Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

The following Bills were read a second time, and *Ordered* to be committed to-morrow:— Bill (No. 26) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Sale of Goods Act.'"

Bill (No. 27) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Assignment of Book Accounts Act.'"

Bill (No. 28) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Timber Royalty Act.'"

On the second reading of Bill (No. 23) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Succession Duty Act'" a debate arose, which was, on the motion of Mr. *Bowser*, adjourned until to-morrow.

Bill (No. 24) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Complex Ore Process Aid Act'" was committed.

Reported without amendment. Report adopted. Third reading to-morrow.

Bill (No. 12) intituled "An Act respecting the Civil Service" was committed. Progress reported. Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock to-morrow.

Mr. Pooley asked the Hon. the Minister of Agriculture the following question :----

Was the sum of \$308.33 paid to Wm. Manson supposed to cover remuneration for his services as Superintendent of the Agricultural Credit Commission for any period after December 31st, 1916?

The Hon. Mr. Oliver replied as follows :---

"The sum of \$308.33 paid to Wm. Manson was allowance in full for all services rendered as Superintendent of the Agricultural Credit Commission."

Mr. Ross asked the Hon. the Minister of Agriculture the following question :---

From what points (if any) on the main line of the Canadian Pacific Railway was seed-grain distributed during the season of 1917?

The Hon. Mr. Oliver replied as follows :--

"No seed has been distributed from points on the main line of the Canadian Pacific Railway Company."

8

Dr. Rose asked the Hon. the Premier the following questions:--

1. How many applications have been received for positions in the Assessor's Office, Quesnel, since the 24th of November last, and what are the names of the applicants?

2. How many appointments to the Assessor's staff have been made since the 24th of November last?

3. If so, what are their names and ages?

4. On whose recommendation were the appointments made?

5. Has the Government or any member of the Government received any letters or messages making any complaints or charges against any of the staff in the Assessor's Office at Quesnel?

6. If so, who are the letters or messages from, and what is the nature of the complaints?

The Hon. Mr. Brewster replied as follows :--

"1. One. Thomas Arnold Fox.

"2. One.

"3. Thomas Arnold Fox; age 48 years.

"4. John M. Yorston, M.L.A.

"5. No.

"6. Answered by No. 5." •

Mr. Hall asked the Hon. the Minister of Railways the following questions:-

1. With respect to Mainland section of Canadian Northern Pacific Railway (that portion referred to in subparagraph (a) of paragraph 4 of the agreement dated the 17th January, 1910, the Schedule to chapter 3, Statutes of 1910), for what mileage have bonds been issued by the Canadian Northern Pacific Railway Company and guaranteed by the Province?

2. With respect to the Vancouver Island section of said railway (being that portion referred to in subparagraph (b) of said paragraph 4 of the agreement aforesaid), for what mileage have bonds been issued by the Canadian Northern Pacific Railway Company and guaranteed by the Province?

3. For what amounts have bonds issued as set out in questions 1 and 2 been sold with respect to: (a) Mainland section; (b) Vancouver Island section?

4. What are the total sums received as proceeds of such sale or sales of said bonds with respect to: (a) Mainland section; (b) Vancouver Island section?

5. What are the totals of the amounts placed to credit of Minister of Finance as proceeds of said bonds with respect to: (a) Mainland section; (b) Vancouver Island section?

6. What balance (if any) is there to the credit of the Minister of Finance from proceeds of said bonds with respect to: (a) Mainland section; (b) Vancouver Island section?

The Hon. Mr. Oliver replied as follows :---

"1. Five hundred miles.

"2. One hundred miles.

"3. Six hundred miles at \$35,000 per mile equals \$21,000,000. The bonds for the Main Line and Island were not kept distinct.

"4. For sale and pledge £4,011,737 17s. 3d. was received on account of bonds issued for Mainland and Island.

" 5. \$19,514,394.14.

"6. Nothing at credit."

Mr. Keen asked the Hon. the Minister of Education the following questions :---

1. When are examinations of scholars held in Kootenay schools?

2. When were the last examinations held in Kaslo?

3. Who is the School Inspector of the Kaslo schools?

4. When was he first in the employ of the Department?

5. When did he leave it, if at any time?

6. When did he rejoin the Department; if so, in what capacity?

7. What is his position at the present time?

The Hon. Dr. MacLean replied as follows :---

"1. On the Monday, Tuesday, and Wednesday of the last week of the winter school term. "2. On June 26th, 27th, and 28th, 1916. But the Department has been informed by the Inspector that the examination in Reading for 1917 has already been held in Kaslo; the reason given being that there are in the neighbourhood of 365 candidates in Inspectorate No. 10, spread over fifty schools, and that to save time and expense he is marking the candidates in Reading as he inspects these schools in March, April, May, and June.

"3. Alexander J. Dove.

"4. September 1st, 1915; previous to that date he had been teaching under Boards of School Trustees for some years, although not consecutively, on the Island, in Kaslo, and in Ashcroft. "5. Answered by No. 4.

"6. Answered by No. 4.

"7. Inspector of Public Schools for Inspectorate No. 10, with headquarters at Nelson."

And then the House adjourned at 5.50 p.m.

Tuesday, 24th April, 1917.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

Prayers by the Rev. Walter G. Letham.

REPORT No. 6.

LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE ROOM, April 23rd, 1917.

MR. SPEAKER:

Your Select Standing Committee on Private Bills and Standing Orders begs leave to report as follows :---

That the preamble of the undermentioned Bill has been proved, and the Bill ordered to be reported with amendments.

Bill (No. 50) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Vancouver Incorporation Act, 1900.'" All of which is respectfully submitted.

M. B. JACKSON, Chairman.

The report was received.

On the motion of Mr. Mobley, seconded by Mr. Keen, it was Resolved,-

That all letters, papers, vouchers, and documents relating to the collection or alleged collection of timber royalties in the Province of British Columbia by A. Carney be referred to the Public Accounts Committee, with instructions to inquire into all circumstances attending said collections or alleged collections, and to ascertain the disposition of the moneys (if any) collected; and with further instructions to report to this House their findings in the matter.

On the motion of the Hon. the Premier, seconded by the Hon. the Minister of Agriculture, it was Resolved,-

That on to-morrow and on all following days to the close of the Session there shall be two distinct sittings in each day, one from 2 p.m. to 6 p.m., and the other from 8 p.m. until adjournment, unless otherwise ordered.

Mr. Speaker Weart gave his reserved ruling on the point of order raised by the Hon. Mr. Macdonald on the 20th inst., referring to certain questions asked concerning the Workmen's Compensation Board, as follows:—

On the calling of the Orders of the Day on Friday last, the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition (Mr. *Bowser*) asked the Hon. the Attorney-General the series of questions standing in his name on the Order Paper.

The Hon. the Attorney-General rose to a point of order, and stated that as the answers to the series of questions were to be supplied by the Workmen's Compensation Board, a body created under the provisions of the "Workmen's Compensation Act," being chapter 77 of the Statutes of 1916, and as the provisions of that Act were not brought within the control of the Department for which the Hon. the Attorney-General is responsible, he could not answer the questions, and asked for a ruling.

The Rules and Orders of the House (No. 45) provide that questions may be put to Ministers of the Crown relating to public affairs.

It is laid down in May, 11th edition, page 248, that "Questions addressed to Ministers should relate to the public affairs with which they are officially connected, to proceedings pending in Parliament, or to any matter of administration for which the Minister is responsible."

In perusing the provision of the "Workmen's Compensation Act," I find that section 56 constitutes the Board a body corporate, its members being appointed by the Lieutenant-Governor in Council.

Section 49 makes provision for auditing the accounts of the Board by the Auditor-General, or by an auditor appointed by the Lieutenant-Governor in Council.

Section 50 makes it obligatory upon the Board to report annually to the Lieutenant-Governor its transactions during the preceding year.

Section 48 provides that the Minister of Finance shall be custodian of certain moneys, etc.

I fail to find any provision in the Act or in the "Constitution Act" bringing its operations under the control of the Attorney-General's Department.

Bourinot, while not an authority in this House, enables me to form a conclusion on the point of order raised, and on page 312, 4th edition, states:—

"(3.) If in the opinion of Mr. Speaker a question on the Order Paper put to a Minister of the Crown is of such a nature as to require a lengthy reply, he may upon the request of the Government direct the same to stand as a notice of motion and to be transferred to its proper place as such upon the Order Paper, the Clerk of the House being authorized to amend the same as to matters of form.

"(4.) If a question is of such a nature that in the opinion of the Minister who is to furnish the reply such reply should be in the form of a return, and the Minister states that he has no objection to lay such return upon the table of the House, his statement shall, unless otherwise ordered by the House, be deemed an Order of the House to that effect, and the same shall be entered in the Votes and Proceedings as such."

The same authority, on page 315, states that "A series of questions has not been answered because it embodied matters which should be formally moved for by order or address."

This practice not being in force in this House, notice in the usual way would be required. Volume 39, Parliamentary Debates, at page 51, I find the following question:—

"D. A. Thomas: I beg to ask the Chancellor of the Exchequer if his attention has been drawn to the fact that the ordinary shares of the majority of the South Wales Collieries quoted on Cardiff Stock Exchange are below par?

"Mr. Speaker: Had I seen the question on the Paper I should have ruled it out of order, as it obviously deals with a matter not within the official knowledge or duties of the Minister to whom it is addressed.

"Mr. Channing asks: As to Press accommodation in connection with the proceedings of the South African Committee.

"Mr. Speaker: Question is a breach of privilege of the House, as it asks the Commissioner of Works to deal with matters which are entirely outside of his cognizance. As to the suggestion of changing the Committee Room, this is a matter entirely in the hands of the Sergeant-at-Arms and not within the cognizance of the Minister; therefore I suggest the questions shall not be put." (House Debates, Fourth Series, 46, page 784.) 25th April.

I am of the opinion that as the matters referred to in the series of questions put by the Hon. the Leader of the Opposition come within the provision of the "Workmen's Compensation Act," and are under the jurisdiction of the Board, and are not matters of administration for which the Attorney-General's Department is responsible, therefore he is not obliged to answer the questions.

J. W. WEART, Speaker.

Mr. Cowper asked the Hon, the Attorney-General the following questions:-

1. How many applications for compensation for injuries have been received by the Workmen's Compensation Board from January 1st, 1917, to date?

2. What proportion of these applications arose from industrial accidents occurring in the City of Victoria?

3. What proportion of the total number of applications come from the City of Vancouver?

4. What proportion of the total number of applications come from Vancouver Island?

5. What proportion of the total number of applications come from the Mainland of British Columbia?

Mr. Speaker ruled the questions out of order under the ruling just given.

Pursuant to Order, the House resumed the adjourned debate on the motion, "That Mr. Speaker do now leave the Chair," for the purpose of going into Committee of Supply.

On the motion of Captain Hayward, the debate was adjourned until to-morrow.

Bill (No. 24) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Complex Ore Process Aid Act'" was read a third time and passed.

Bill (No. 15) intituled "An Act respecting the Marking of Cattle and Horses" was again committed.

Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Bill (No. 12) intituled "An Act respecting the Civil Service" was again committed. Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock to-morrow.

And then the House adjourned at 5.45 p.m.

Wednesday, 25th April, 1917.

HALF-PAST TWO O'CLOCK P.M.

Prayers by the Rev. H. S. Payne.

Mr. *Farris* presented a further interim report from the Select Committee appointed to inquire into all matters relating to the construction of the Pacific Great Eastern Railway, as follows:—

LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE ROOM, April 25th, 1917.

MR. SPEAKER:

Your Select Committee to inquire into the Pacific Great Eastern Railway begs to report that Mr. Ed. White, of Vancouver, a witness before your Committee, has failed to reappear before the Committee and to produce certain private ledgers of Mr. P. Welch admitted by the witness to be in his possession, although ordered so to do by the Committee.

Your Committee also begs to report that Mr. W. J. Bowser, whilst a witness before your Committee, refused to answer questions relative to the statements made by Mr. D'Arcy Tate before your Committee with reference to the payment of campaign funds to the Conservative party.

All of which is respectfully submitted.

J. W. DE B. FARRIS, Chairman of the Committee.

The report was received.

On the motion of Mr. Farris, seconded by Mr. Hall, it was Resolved,-

That the Speaker do issue his warrant to compel the attendance of E. F. White at the Bar of the House.

Mr. Thompson presented a Report from the Mining Committee, as follows:-

LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE ROOM,

April 25th, 1917.

MR. SPEAKER:

That in the matter of the petition of one Robert T. Ward *et al.*, presented to this House on the 14th day of March, 1917, and referred by the House to your Committee, your Committee having heard the evidence adduced on behalf of the petitioners and on behalf of one Hopp and his associates, and having found that equities and complicated questions of equity, law, and fact arose therein, recommends that the matters involved in the said petition be referred to a statutory Board of Arbitrators, one to be named by Mr. Ward, one to be named by Mr. Hopp, and a third to be named by the two so chosen, or, in default of their agreement as to a third arbitrator, by the Lieutenant-Governor in Council, and that the findings of the said Board be final and binding as between the parties and as between the parties and the Crown.

J. E. W. THOMPSON, Chairman.

The report was received.

F. S. BARNARD,

Lieutenant-Governor.

The Lieutenant-Governor transmits herewith a Bill intituled "An Act to amend the 'Vancouver and Districts Joint Sewerage and Drainage Act,'" and recommends the same to the Legislative Assembly.

Government House, April 25th, 1917.

Ordered, That the said Message, and the Bill accompanying the same, be referred to a Committee of the Whole House forthwith.

(IN THE COMMITTEE.)

Resolved, That the Committee rise and report to the House, recommending the introduction of a Bill (No. 31) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Vancouver and Districts Joint Sewerage and Drainage Act," a draft of which is annexed to this Resolution.

Resolution and Bill reported and adopted. Bill introduced and read a first time. Second reading at the next sitting. The Hon. Mr. Macdonald presented to Mr. Speaker a Message from His Honour the Lieutenant-Governor, which read as follows:---

F. S. BARNARD,

Lieutenant-Governor.

The Lieutenant-Governor transmits herewith a Bill intituled "An Act to amend the 'Trust Companies Act," and recommends the same to the Legislative Assembly.

Government House,

April 25th, 1917.

Ordered, That the said Message, and the Bill accompanying the same, be referred to a Committee of the Whole House forthwith.

(IN THE COMMITTEE.)

Resolved, That the Committee rise and report to the House, recommending the introduction of a Bill (No. 32) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Trust Companies Act,'" a draft of which is annexed to this Resolution.

Resolution and Bill reported and adopted. Bill introduced and read a first time. Second reading at the next sitting.

Pursuant to Order, the House resumed the adjourned debate on the motion, "That Mr. Speaker do now leave the Chair," for the purpose of going into Committee of Supply. On the motion of Mr. *Fisher*, the debate was adjourned until to-morrow.

Bill (No. 26) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Sale of Goods Act'" was committed. Reported without amendment. Report adopted. Third reading to-morrow.

Bill (No. 27) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Assignment of Book Accounts Act'" was committed.

Reported without amendment. Report adopted. Third reading to-morrow.

Bill (No. 28) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Timber Royalty Act'" was committed. Reported without amendment. Report adopted. Third reading to-morrow.

The House resumed the adjourned debate on the second reading of Bill (No. 23) intituled "An Act to amend the 'Succession Duty Act.'"

Bill read a second time.

To be committed to-morrow.

Bill (No. 15) intituled "An Act respecting the Marking of Cattle and Horses" was again committed.

Progress reported.

Committee to sit again to-morrow.

Resolved, That the House, at its rising, do stand adjourned until 2.30 o'clock to-morrow.

And then the House adjourned at 4.50 p.m.